| **Student Name:** Alexander Zhu |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house would introduce a salary cap for professional sportspeople |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 to 6 minutes’ long.]  Good call-out in the hook that the problem was not severe to begin with, but try to immediately prove why you think athletes already receive fair compensation today.  I appreciate the clash and counterfactual!   * But we should consider adding something to deal with the problems of corruption and lack of transparency that Prop highlighted. * We are lacking BOTH a framing and a burden today.   Nice use of example to explain the rise of certain athletes, but we need to explain why this trajectory is directly related to the merit of the athletes.   * It’s not that the athlete is not fully deserving of the pay, Proposition is saying it’s so incredibly disproportionate to the point of depriving other athletes the opportunity for better pay.   Good rebuttal that underrated players will still be underpaid in Prop’s world, but we need to attack Prop’s model that the wealth at the top WILL be distributed to the bottom tier.   * Question why this cannot happen.   + Explain that Prop fiat only extends to a salary cap, not to where the excess salary will be distributed to.   While I understand intuitively that many athletes are paid well, there are MANY professional athletes who aren’t playing for big leagues and clubs, and they are barely surviving.   * You need to suggest something to deal with this problem instead of just denying their existence.   Good incentive analysis on athletes striving to be the very best.   * However, is a huge financial incentive really necessary? Presumably, professional athletes naturally want to be the best at what they do. * We need a stronger impact statement on lowering the competitiveness of sports once a whole bunch of athletes have met the salary cap.   On idolising these athletes as role models, it’s unclear why ANY of this is tied down to having to pay these athletes an extravagant amount of money.   * Why are other measures insufficient in doing this?   Work on speech structure, and labelling the transitions clearly please.  Good job offering POIs!   * Please also offer some to the 2nd speaker, don’t rest just because your speech has finished.   6.25 | | | | | | |